Supplementary information for 'Does immigration undermine public support for integration in the European Union?'

Dimiter Toshkov and Elitsa Kortenska

December 22, 2014

This appendix provides additional details about the operationalization and data sources of the variables used in the analysis and a table with descriptive statistics of the variables used in the study.

1 Operationalization and data sources

Ireland

EU support is measured as the percentage of votes in favour at the national Referendum on EU Constitutional Treaty conducted in Ireland in 2008. Data per *Dail* constituency is available from Christopher Took and Sen Donnelly: `http://electionsireland.org/`).

CEE immigration is measured by the number of persons whose place of birth is either Poland and/or Lithuania. The data is based on Census 2006 per *Dail* constituency. There is no available information for citizens born in other CEE countries, so we take this as a proxy of CEE levels of immigration. We transformed the numbers into a percentage of the total population in the district.

Population is based on the 2006 Census and captures the persons, usually resident and present in the State on Census Night, as classified by place of birth as percentage of total population. The data is available from the Central Statistics Office of Ireland: `http://census.cso.ie/Census/ReportFolders/ReportFolders.aspx`.

Other immigration is measured by the number of 'Persons usually resident and present in the State on Census Night 2006', whose place of birth is neither a EU member state, nor the UK and falls into 'the rest of the world' in the classification of the Central Statistical

office in Ireland. It is taken for our purposes as a percentage of the total population counted.

Government support is computed as the sum of the votes for the three parties forming the coalition government in the 2007 *Dail* Election as a percentage of total number of votes cast. Data is available from the European Election Database (see also Christopher Took and Sen Donnelly:`http://electionsireland.org/`).

Unemployment data is available also from the the 2006 Census 2006 and captures persons unemployed in all occupations and both genders. We compute the measure as the percentage of unemployed from the total number of persons at work and unemployed. Data available at: `http://census.cso.ie/census/ReportFolders/ReportFolders.aspx`.

Education is measured by the number of persons, males and females aged 15 years and over in each *Dail* electoral district who completed a third level degree or higher as of 2006. Data is available at the Central Statistics Office (CSO).

France

EU support is measured as the percentage of favorable votes at the national Referendum on EU Constitutional Treaty in 2005. Regional level results are available at: `http://cdsp.sciences-po.fr/AE.php`.

CEE immigration is measured as the percentage of foreign populations, whose country of birth is one of the new EU10 member states. Additional calculations were needed to capture the number of citizens, whose country of birth is a new member states as not all are available (calculation: EU10 CEE = EU26 - EU14). We take the percentage of CEE foreigners out of the total population as of 2010, given that this is the only available data at departmental level in France.

Population data has been obtained by the French national statistical institute Institut national de la statistique et des etudes conomiques (Insee): `http://insee.fr/fr/themes/theme.asp?theme=2&sous_theme=5&nivgeo=99&type=2&produit=OK`.

Other immigration is measured by the number of foreign born persons, whose country of birth is outside Europe and/or EU as of 2010. The measurement we take is a sum of the numbers of foreigners born in one of the 30 countries for which separate data is available and

are non-member states. Among those are, for example, Tunisia, Russia, Sri Lank, Turkey, Armenia, Vietnam, Serbia, etc. Data is obtained from Insee. The calculated number is transformed into percentage of the total population per department.

Government support is measured by taking the percentage of votes for Chirac (UMP) in the 1st Round of the 2002 Presidential Election. Data is available at:`http://cdsp.sciences-po.fr/AE.php`.

Unemployment is measured as the percentage of unemployed out of the total workforce as of the 1st Quarter of 2005. Data is available and obtained from the French statistical institute (INSEE): `http://www.insee.fr/fr/themes/detail.asp?ref_id=ir-eds2009&page=irweb/eds2009/dd/eds2009_chomage.htm`.

Education is measured as the percentage of citizens, above the age of 15, who have obtained a highest level of diploma in 2010 (short-terms) summed up with the percentage of citizens, above the age of 15, who have obtained highest level of diploma in 2010 (long-terms). Entries for this variable are not available for 2005, but there is available data for 1999. Data per department is available from the INSEE: `http://www.insee.fr/fr/bases-de-donnees/default.asp?page=recensement/resultats/doc/conseils_utilisation.htm`.

Spain

EU support is measured, based on the percentage of favorable votes at the national Referendum on EU Constitutional Treaty in 2005. Data is obtained from the European Elections Database and the Ministerio Del Interior (Ministry of the Interior): `http://www.elecciones.mir.es/`.

CEE immigration is measured as the number of citizens, legally residing in the region, whose country of nationality is one of the CEE countries. The sum of all citizens born in EU10 MS is calculated (EU10= BG+Sl+Sk+EE+HU+LV+LT+CZ+PL+RO) and then transformed into a percentage of the total population. Data is obtained from the national statistical institute (Instituto Nacional de Estadstica (INE)) `http://www.ine.es/jaxi/menu.do?type=pcaxis&path=%2Ft20%2Fe260&file=inebase&L=1`.

Population is gathered as of 1st of January 2005 and captures all the citizens, legally residing in the region by country of nationality including Spain. `http://www.ine.es/jaxi/menu.do?type=pcaxis&path=%2Ft20%2Fe260&file=inebase&L=1`.

Other immigration is measured by number of citizens, legally residing in the region, whose nationality is neither EU10, nor EU14 as of 1st of January 2005. The number is readily available in the INE data, and we transformed it into a percentage of the total population.

Government support is measured as the percentage of votes for PSOE party (in government in 2005) at the 2004 Parliamentary Election. The data is available from the Ministerio Del Interior (Ministry of the Interior): `http://www.elecciones.mir.es/`.

Unemployment Data on the unemployment rates in Spains provinces is available from the Instituto Nacional de Estadstica (INE). We take the unemployment rate in the first quarter of 2005. Data has been gathered by the statistical institute through Economically Active Population Survey and is available at: `http://www.ine.es/jaxiBD/menu.do?L=1&divi=EPA&his=0&type=db`.

Education is measured as the percentage of people who have completed a higher educational degree either a Master or a Doctoral degree out of the total population of citizens per region. This does not include citizens who are now in the process of completing their degree. The data is taken for the year 2005.

The Netherlands

EU support is measured as the percentage of voters who answered In favor at the national Referendum on EU Constitutional Treaty in 2005. The data has been obtained from the Dutch national election database KIESRAAD (`https://www.kiesraad.nl/`). The question towards the Dutch public was formulated as follows: Are you in favor of or against approval by the Netherlands of the Treaty establishing a Constitution for Europe?

CEE immigration - the percentage of citizens out of the total population, who were residing in the Netherlands as of 1 January 2005 and whose country of birth is one of the CEE Countries. An immigrant is defined as any person, who is legally residing in

the Netherlands for more than 4 months and is registered in the respective municipality and whose country of birth is different from the Netherlands. Since the number of EU foreigners is readily given and it includes all the new 10 MS as of 2004, we subtracted from it the sum of the numbers of foreigners from the old member states, for which separate information is provided. The number of immigrants from NMS equals the number of EU24 (excluding NL) foreigners minus the sum of the numbers of foreigners from Austria, Belgium, Germany, France, Italy, Spain, UK, Portugal, Denmark and Greece. The remaining number is transformed into percentage out of the total population.

Population - Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS) as of 1 January 2005.

Other immigration is measured by the total percentage of citizens, whose country of birth is not a EU member state nor Bulgarian and Romania as of 1 January 2005. The numbers are readily available from CBS, and needed only to be transformed into the percentage out of the total population.

Government support the government at the time of the 2005 Referendum was a coalition government of three parties - CDA - Christian Democratic Appeal, VVD - People's Party for Freedom and D66 - Democrats 66, since no party received the majority of votes in the 2003 parliamentary election (source: KIESRAAD). The sum of the percentage of votes each party received gives the measure for incumbent government support. Data from: `https://www.kiesraad.nl/`.

Unemployment: an indicator of unemployment levels per municipality are the unemployment benefits provided by each municipality. The data is downloaded from CBS for the year 2005 and is given in numbers of unemployment benefits according to the Unemployment Act (WW) (CBS). In order to make it consistent we transformed the number into a percentage out of the total population of the municipality. The measurement adopted in our dataset is the percentage (0-100) of unemployment benefits out of the total population per municipality.

Education is measured by the number of citizens holding a Masters degree and/or Doctoral degree, summed with the number of citizens holding a higher educational Bachelor degree, transformed into a percentage out of the total population. Data has been obtained

as of 2005 and is provided by the CBS on municipality level.

Income is tapped by average disposable income data, which is based on official records from the Ministry of Finance and the Dutch municipalities (GBA). Data is provided for previous year and consists of the average personal earnings after the reduction of taxes and shows the average personal income left for spending and saving from CBS. It covers citizens who receive income throughout the whole year for all 52 weeks, including the self-employed. For these reasons 2006 data was downloaded, since it summarizes the average personal income per municipality for 2005. The average disposable income is given in thousands of Euros for each municipality.

Religiosity is measured via a dummy variable (0-1) taken from the percentage of citizens who have voted for the SGP in the 2003 parliamentary election (where ¿5 per cent voted = 1, and ¡5 per cent voted = 0). Data is available from the KIESRAAD database: `https://www.kiesraad.nl/`.

Abbreviations

BE: Belgium, BG: Bulgaria, CZ: Czech Republic, DK: Denmark, DE: Germany, EE: Estonia, IE: Ireland, GR: Greece, ES: Spain, FR: France, IT: Italy, CY: Cyprus, LV: Latvia, LT: Lithuania, LU: Luxembourg, HU: Hungary, MT: Malta, NL: Netherlands, AT: Austria, PL: Poland, PT: Portugal, RO: Romania, SI: Slovenia, SK: Slovakia, FI: Finland, SE: Sweden, UK: United Kingdom.

2 Descriptive statistics for the variables used in the analysis

Country and level	Min	Mean	Max	St.dev.
Ireland, 42 Counties *[LAU-1]*				
EU support (%)	34·95	46·03	63·46	6·80
CEE immigrants (%)	0·62	2·07	5·05	0·86
Other immigrants (%)	1·40	4·09	12·95	2·68
Gov. support (%)	25·68	48·99	63·44	7·85
Unemployment (%)	4·07	7·27	11·93	2·00
Education	9050	19087	41291	7910
Popul. (thousands)	67	97	137	22
France, 96 Departments *[NUTS-3]*				
EU support (%)	31·00	43·56	66·00	6·27
CEE immigrants (%)	0·10	0·73	2·75	0·61
Other immigrants (%)	0·43	3·57	21·51	3·25
Gov. support (%)	14·00	19·77	34·00	3·42
Unemployment (%)	5·20	8·33	12·50	1·57
Education (%)	14·30	22·13	55·00	6·23
Popul. (thousands)	81	671	2,618	503
Spain, 51 Provinces *[NUTS-3]*				
EU support (%)	56·46	79·10	88·53	7·54
CEE immigrants (%)	0·00	1·33	5·88	1·34
Other immigrants (%)	0·95	5·73	69·05	9·46
Gov. support (%)	26·71	42·35	59·35	7·44
Unemployment (%)	4·71	10·42	20·00	3·63
Education (%)	9·83	19·83	33·58	5·00
Popul. (thousands)	67	828	5,821	1,046
The Netherlands, 466 Municipalities *[LAU-2]*				
EU support (%)	8·37	38·05	62·38	7·39
CEE immigrants (%)	0·03	0·26	1·37	0·15
Other immigrants (%)	1·40	6·12	34·90	4·08
Gov. support (%)	16·28	55·14	82·45	9·14
Unemployment	0·51	1·39	3·04	0·45
Income	8·90	12·74	20·80	1·35
Education	0·09	0·37	2·54	0·23
Religiosity	0·00	0·13	1·00	0·34
Popul. (thousands)	1	41	790	64

Table 1: **Descriptive statistics**